Experimental design in the deep-sea to answer basic deep-sea mining questions: an initial examination

Jeff Ardron, Daniel Jones, Erik Simon-Lledó

U Southampton, NOC, NERC; Commonwealth Secretariat PRZ / IRZ workshop, Berlin, 27-29 Sept. 2017



National Oceanography Centre NATURAL ENVIRONMENT RESEARCH COUNCI





Three Questions: in the Clarion Clipperton Fracture Zone...

1. How large a sample is "enough"? (= Confidence)

2. How many samples is "enough"? (= Power)

3. What effect size is "enough"? (= Importance)

(PS: note the insignificance of significance testing if these three questions are not addressed...)







M079-81-83 - Images 1-10 of 5858								🖬 🗱 🖼 C 🥜 Welcome Erik Si				Simon						
<	Search	A 56.jpg	©∔	ID Flat/M	ID X Image versions V Annotations V M079652543.jpg Flat/M079654246.jpg				tions - Anno	Flat/M079	lags - Thumb 9655949.jpg	Q1: How large a megafaunal (photo) sample is "enough"?						
		M07	79-81- Sear	83 - I	mages 1-	27 of 585	8	X Ima	ne versions -	Annotations -		Elags	Thumb size	<i>8</i> w	elcome Erik S	imon 👤		
	Flat/M079(74736		A MARSON AND	74737		74738		74739	74740	74741		74742	74743	74	744		
		14130	小社		> N	1079-81-8	33 - Imag	jes 1-52 of	f 5858					cs <u>v</u>	C	🕜 Welc	ome Erik Simor	.
	74741 annotate	74745			• •	Searc	h	A	⊙↓ ID ×	Image ve	A	nnotations -	Annotators -	Flags -				× **
				and the second	7473	6 7	4737	74738	74739	74740	74741	74742	74743	74744	74745	74746	74747	74748
		74754			7474	9 7	4750	74751	74752	74753	74754	74755	74756	74757	74758	74759	74760	74761
					7476	2 7	4763	74764	74765	74766	74767	74768	74769	74770	74771	74772	74773	74774
					7477	5 7	4776	74777	74778	74779	74780	74781	74782	74783	74784	74785	74786	74787



K

National Oceanography Centre NATURAL ENVIRONMENT RESEARCH COUNCIL



NERC SCIENCE OF THE ENVIRONMENT

A: It depends on what you want to measure...



(Unpublished data from the CCZ)







A: It depends on what you want to measure...



(Unpublished data from the CCZ)



Oceanography Centre NATURAL ENVIRONMENT RESEARCH COUNCIL

National



NERC SCIENCE OF THE ENVIRONMENT

A: It depends on what you want to measure...



Cumulative megafaunal density appears measureable using samples two or three times smaller than for 'community...'

(And 20-30x smaller than for spp richness...)

NFR

But... densities of individual species (red & green dots) require much larger sample areas than cumulative densities



One typical conservation strategy is to monitor & protect less common large species, but it is unlikely in the CCZ, due to sampling requirements (**red: 25**th **percentile of abundance**).

Monitoring and thus protecting 'average' species (green: median abundance) is more tractable.



National Oceanography Centre NATURAL ENVIRONMENT RESEARCH COUNCI



NERC SCIENCE OF THE ENVIRONMENT

Q2: How many samples is "enough"?

98. VOLUME T. NUMBER 3

pression, Journal of Clinical Psychiatry, 51, 61-69 (1990).

11. L.R. Baxter, Jr., J.M. Schwartz, B.H. Guze, J.C. Mazziotta, M.P. Szuba, K. Bergman, A. Alazraki, C.E. Selin, H.K. Freng, P. Munford, and M.E. Phelps, Obsessive-compulsive disorder vs. Tourette's disorder: Differential function in subdivisions of the neostriatum, paper presented at the annual meeting of the American Col chopharmacology, San Juar (December 1991).

 E.M. Reiman, M.E. Raich Herscovitch, and E. Robins, A focity in panic disorder, a severe for ture, 310, 683–685 (1984); E.M. ichle, E. Robins, F.K. Butler, P. He

Statistical Power Analysis

Jacob Cohen

The power of a statistical test of a null hypothesis (H_0) is the probability that the H_0 will be rejected when it is false, that is, the probability of

which r indeed does ec searchers risk mistaker the H_0 when it is true, a whose rate (.05) is cont

CURRENT DIRECTIONS IN PS

PO					919	27
for	the	429 542 789	191 241 351	108 136 198	69 87 127	48 61 88
BE SC	HAV		RAI S	-		
	.05	.10		.20	.25	.30
Secon	d Edition	119	53	30	20	14
.70	797	200	89	50		23
.80	1029	258	115	65	- 53	25
-90	1395	349	156		57	40
. 95	1718	435	194	109	76	49
Jac	op Co	onen	276	155	100	75

.05



Oceanography Centre NATURAL ENVIRONMENT RESEARCH COUNCIL

National



Q2: How many samples is "enough"?



Wikipedia; 20 Sept. 2017

Jacob Cohen defined s, the pooled standard deviation, as (for two independent samples):^{[7]:67}

$$s=\sqrt{rac{(n_1-1)s_1^2+(n_2-1)s_2^2}{n_1+n_2-2}}$$

Nerdy word of caution over Wikipedia...

Actually, Cohen's d does not subtract 2.

This was a later suggestion by Hedge to compensate for smaller numbers of samples –a variant called 'Hedge's g' – which is probably the case in the deep-sea.



National Oceanography Centre NATURAL ENVIRONMENT RESEARCH COUNCIL



Q2: How many samples is "enough"?



Q3: What effect size is "enough"?

There is no 'right answer', but...

- 1. Cohen's guidelines were based on psychology and human testing; it is unknown if these are transferable to deep-sea ecology.
- 2. Effects on deep-sea ecology will be limited to the parameters that can be measured with tractable size and number of samples. Thus, some critical questions (e.g. 'biodiversity') may not be directly sampled in a statistically meaningful way (will need modelling and macro-ecological indicators).
- 3. BACI effects of most interest (e.g. effects of deposition of fines on communities, and signs of natural recovery in abundance) could conceivably be in the realm of 0.5 SD magnitude, and require about 75 samples (of appropriate size).

PS: A non-significant result without enough power tells us nothing; and a significant result arising from just a few samples (i.e. low power) is going to be very obvious anyway...





Three Closing Thoughts

- 1. Measuring some parameters will require larger sample areas than others.
 - Selection of parameters will be a balance of cost versus criticality (legal obligations and risk).
- 2. Power analyses are necessary to separate out meaningful from statistically 'trivial' or inconclusive significance results.
 - Power analyses will need to be done beforehand, to determine the appropriate experimental design, esp. number of samples. Power analyses, however, require comprehensive baseline data.
- 3. Determining what is a meaningful effect size for a given variable is both a scientific and a policy question. Answers may vary according to the risk of 'serious harm'.
 - Agreement on effect sizes will be necessary in order to determine the experimental design and management responses. Examining Cohen's recommendations and the discussion since, could be the starting point.





